

ROBBINS ARROYO LLP
KEVIN A. SEELY (199982)
kseely@robbinsarroyo.com
STEVEN M. MCKANY (271405)
smckany@robbinsarroyo.com
DARNELL R. DONAHUE (281926)
ddonahue@robbinsarroyo.com
5040 Shoreham Place
San Diego, CA 92122
Telephone: (619) 525-3990
Facsimile: (619) 525-3991

[Additional counsel on signature page]

Attorneys for Plaintiff

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
WESTERN DIVISION

VALERIE WATSON, individually
and on behalf of a class of similarly
situated individuals,

PLAINTIFF,

v.

SOLID GOLD PET, LLC

DEFENDANT.

Case No. 2:18-CV-06479 PSG (SSx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

**[Discovery Document: Referred to
Magistrate Judge Suzanne H. Segal]**

Magistrate Judge:
Hon. Suzanne H. Segal

1 Plaintiff Valerie Watson ("Plaintiff"), and Solid Gold Pet, LLC ("Defendant,"
2 together with Plaintiff, the "Parties") stipulate and jointly move the Court to issue
3 the following protective order ("Protective Order" or the "Order") to govern the
4 disclosure of documents, things, and information produced in the above-captioned
5 action.

6 **1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

7 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
8 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
9 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
10 be warranted. Accordingly, the Parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
11 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The Parties acknowledge that this
12 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
13 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
14 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
15 under the applicable legal principles. The Parties further acknowledge, as set forth
16 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
17 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
18 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
19 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

20 **B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

21 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, supplier information, customer
22 and pricing lists and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial,
23 technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public
24 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is
25 warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of,
26 among other things, confidential business or financial information, (such as
27 personnel records, employee files, and/or proprietary financial data) information
28 regarding confidential business practices (such as market surveys, consumer

research studies, and/or proprietary consultant analysis), or other confidential research, development, or commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the Parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the Parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the Parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: this pending federal law suit.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
2 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
4 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
9 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
10 counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
12 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
14 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
15 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
16 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
23 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."
28

1 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
2 from a Producing Party.

3 **3. SCOPE**

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
10 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11 **4. DURATION**

12 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
13 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
14 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
15 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
16 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
17 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
18 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
19 pursuant to applicable law.

20 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.
22 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
23 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
24 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
25 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
26 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items,
27 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably
28 within the ambit of this Order.

1 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
2 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
3 purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
4 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other Parties) may expose the Designating
5 Party to sanctions.

6 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
7 designated for protection do not qualify for protection that Designating Party must
8 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

9 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
10 this Order (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
11 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
12 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
13 produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (*e.g.*, paper or electronic
16 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
17 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
18 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
19 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
20 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
21 portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
23 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
24 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
25 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
26 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the
27 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
28 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before

1 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
2 "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
3 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
4 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
5 markings in the margins).

6 (b) for testimony given in depositions, the Designating Party may
7 designate the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, including exhibits
8 before the close of the deposition. Upon such designation by counsel, the reporter of
9 the deposition shall place the designated testimony and exhibits in a separate volume
10 marked "CONFIDENTIAL." Alternatively, counsel may designate a deposition or
11 portion thereof as CONFIDENTIAL by designating those portions of the transcript
12 by page and line within twenty days of receipt of the transcript and by so informing
13 the other Party of that designation.

14 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
15 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place
16 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
17 legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
18 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
19 portion(s).

20 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
21 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
22 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
23 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
24 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
25 Order.

1 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

2 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
3 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
4 Scheduling Order.

5 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
6 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

7 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
8 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
9 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
10 Parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
11 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all Parties shall
12 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
13 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
14 challenge.

15 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

16 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
17 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
18 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
19 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
20 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
21 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
22 DISPOSITION).

23 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
24 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
25 authorized under this Order.

26 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
27 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
28

Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

(b) the Parties to the litigation;

(c) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(e) the court and its personnel;

(f) court reporters and their staff;

(g) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(h) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

(i) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise

1 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
2 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
3 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except
4 as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

5 (j) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting
6 personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the Parties engaged in settlement
7 discussions.

8 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
9 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

10 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
11 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
12 "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

13 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such
14 notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

15 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or
16 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
17 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
18 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

19 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
20 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

21 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
22 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
23 action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the
24 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's
25 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
26 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
27 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
28 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

1 **9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
2 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

3 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced
4 by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such
5 information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected
6 by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should
7 be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

8 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request,
9 to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
10 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
11 confidential information, then the Party shall:

12 (i) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the
13 Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
14 agreement with a Non-Party;

15 (ii) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the
16 Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
17 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

18 (iii) make the information requested available for inspection by
19 the Non-Party, if requested.

20 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court
21 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
22 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
23 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
24 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to
25 the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the
26 court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
27 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.
28

1 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
3 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
4 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
5 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
6 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person
7 or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
8 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
9 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

10 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
11 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

12 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
13 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
14 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
15 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
16 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
17 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
18 Parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
19 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
20 Parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
21 to the court.

22 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

23 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
24 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

25 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
26 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
27 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
28

1 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
2 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

3 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
4 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
5 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
6 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
7 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
8 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

9 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

10 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
11 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
12 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
13 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
14 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
15 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
16 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
17 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
18 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
19 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
20 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
21 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
22 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
23 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
24 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
25 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
26 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
27 Section 4 (DURATION).

1 Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
2 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
3 sanctions.

4 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

5 Dated: September 13, 2019

ROBBINS ARROYO LLP
KEVIN A. SEELY (199982)
STEVEN M. MCKANY (271405)
DARNELL R. DONAHUE (281926)

6
7
8 */s/ Steven M. McKany*

STEVEN M. MCKANY

9 5040 Shoreham Place
10 San Diego CA 92122
11 Telephone: (619) 525-3990
12 Facsimile: (619) 525-3991
E-mail: kseely@robbinsarroyo.com
smckany@robbinsarroyo.com
ddonahue@robbinsarroyo.com

13 LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P.
14 ROBERT K. SHELQUIST*
15 REBECCA A. PETERSON (241858)
100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200
16 Minneapolis, MN 55401
Telephone: (612) 339-6900
Facsimile: (612) 339-0981
17 E-mail: rkshelquist@locklaw.com
rapeterson@locklaw.com

18 CUNEO GILBERT & LADUCA, LLP
19 CHARLES LADUCA*
20 KATHERINE VAN DYCK*
4725 Wisconsin Ave NW, Suite 200
21 Washington, DC 20016
Telephone: (202) 789-3960
Facsimile: (202) 789-1813
22 E-mail: kvandyck@cuneolaw.com
charles@cuneolaw.com

23 LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG, LLC
24 JOSEPH DEPALMA*
25 SUSANA CRUZ HODGE*
570 Broad Street, Suite 1201
26 Newark, NJ 07102
Telephone: (973) 623-3000
E-mail: jdepalma@litedepalma.com
scrushodge@litedepalma.com

27 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
28

* admitted *pro hac vice*

Dated: September 13, 2019

K&L GATES LLP
ELLEN L. DARLING
CAITLIN C. BLANCHE
DAMON PITT

/s/ Caitlin C. Blanche

Caitlin C. Blanche
1 Park Plaza Twelfth Floor
Irvine, CA 92614
Telephone: (949) 253-0900
Facsimile: (949) 253-0902
E-mail: caitlin.blanche@klgates.com

Attorney for Defendant Solid Gold Pet, LLC

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: 9/17/19

/S/
The Honorable Suzanne H. Segal
United States Magistrate Judge

1379507

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____[*print or type full*
4 *name*], of _____ [*print*
5 *or type full address*], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety
6 and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States
7 District Court for the Central District of California on _____ in the case of
8 *Watson v. Solid Gold Pet, LLC*, Case No. 2:18-CV-06479-PSG-SS. I agree to
9 comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and
10 I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions
11 and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose
12 in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective
13 Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this
14 Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
16 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
17 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
18 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ of
19 _____ as
20 my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
21 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

22 Date: _____

23 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

24
25 Printed name: _____

26
27 Signature: _____